Minutes of the December 12, 2019, meeting of the South Carolina Board of Health and Environmental Control

The South Carolina Board of Health and Environmental Control met on Thursday, December 12, 2019, at 10:00 a.m. in the Boardroom (#3420) at the South Carolina Department of Health and Environmental Control, 2600 Bull Street, Columbia, South Carolina. (Attachment 0-1)

The following members were in attendance:
- J.B. (Sonny) Kinney, 1st District
- Seema Shrivastava-Patel, 2nd District
- Charles M. Joye, II, P.E., 3rd District
- Richard V. Lee, Jr., 5th District
- Alex A. Singleton, 6th District

4th Congressional District seat is currently vacant.

Also, in attendance were W. Marshall Taylor, Jr., Legal Counsel; M. Denise Crawford, Clerk; Department staff, and members of the public.

Chairman Elam and Vice Chairman Creel were absent, and Mr. Lee assumed the Chair to conduct the meeting. Mr. Lee called the meeting to order and stated notice of this meeting had been provided to all persons, organizations and news media, which have requested notification, as required by Section 30-4-80(e) of the South Carolina Code of Laws.

Item 1: Minutes of November 7, 2019 meeting (Attachment 1-1)

Mr. Kinney moved, seconded by Ms. Shrivastava-Patel, to approve the minutes as presented. The Board voted and Motion carried.

Item 2: Administrative and Consent Orders issued by Health Regulation (Attachment 2-1)

Ms. Bentley White, Director, Health Regulation Policy and Communications, stated for this reporting period four (4) Consent Orders had been issued with assessed penalties totaling $14,300.00.

After discussion, the Board accepted this item as information.

Item 3: Administrative Orders and Consent Orders issued by Environmental Affairs (Attachment 3-1)

Ms. Rebecca Sproles, Liaison, Environmental Affairs, stated that for this reporting period one hundred and fifty-eight (158) Consent Orders with assessed civil penalties totaling
$216,695.00 and seven (7) Administrative Orders with assessed civil penalties totaling $2,200.00 have been issued.

After discussion, the Board accepted this item as information.


A Public Hearing was conducted concerning the Regulation. Mr. Chuck Williams, Manager, Groundwater Protection & Agricultural Permitting Section, Bureau of Water, presented this item to the Board.

The Bureau of Water ("Bureau") proposed Notice of Final Regulation amending R.61-43, Standards for the Permitting of Agricultural Animal Facilities. Legal authority resides in S.C. Code Sections 44-1-60, 44-1-65, 46-45-80, and 48-1-10 et seq., which authorizes the South Carolina Department of Health and Environmental Control ("Department") to promulgate applicable regulations, procedures, or standards as may be necessary to protect human health and the environment. The Administrative Procedures Act, S.C. Code Section 1-23-120(A), requires General Assembly review of these amendments.

The Bureau of Water proposed amending R.61-43 to incorporate Act 139 of 2018, which amended S.C. Code Sections 44-1-60 and 46-45-80 and added Section 44-1-65. S.C. Code Section 44-1-65 establishes specific requirements for review and appeal of decisions by the Department regarding the permitting, licensing, certification, or other approval of poultry and other animal facilities, except for swine facilities. Section 44-1-60 sets procedures for reviewing permits for poultry and other animal facilities, except swine facilities, relating to appeals from Department decisions giving rise to contested cases. Section 46-45-80 includes provisions regarding setback distances for poultry and other animal facilities, except swine facilities, so as to prohibit requiring additional setback distances if established distances are achieved, allow waiver of the established setback distances in certain circumstances, and other purposes. Since the above referenced statutory provisions added and removed requirements currently contained in the R.61-43, Standards for the Permitting of Agricultural Animal Facilities, the regulations should be amended to reflect these changes.

The Department had a Notice of Drafting published in the February 22, 2019, State Register.

The Bureau held two stakeholder meetings on March 28, 2019. Stakeholders provided comments and suggestions regarding the proposed changes to the regulation.

Department staff conducted an internal review of the proposed amendments on April 2, 2019.

The Department had a Notice of Proposed Regulation published in the August 23, 2019, State Register. The Bureau held two additional stakeholder meetings on September 19, 2019, during the Notice of Proposed Regulation public comment period. Overall, the Department received public comments from six people by the September 23, 2019, close of the public comment period.

The Bureau respectfully requested the Board grant a finding of need and reasonableness of the proposed amendment of R.61-43, Standards for the Permitting of Agricultural Animal Facilities, for submission to the General Assembly.
Mr. Taylor opened the meeting up for public comments on this matter, but no one wished to speak, and the public hearing was closed. (Attachment 4-2)

After discussion, Mr. Kinney moved, seconded by Mr. Singleton, that based on the public hearing and documents herein, to find the need and reasonableness of the Proposed Amendment of Regulation 61-43, Standards for the Permitting of Agricultural Animal Facilities, Document No. 4886, and grant approval for the submission to the General Assembly for review. The Board voted and Motion carried.

A verbatim transcript of these proceedings is included as part of the official record. (Attachment 4-3)

Item 5: Public Hearing and Request for Notice of Final Regulation Approval, Regulation 30-1, Statement of Policy, and Regulation 30-14, Administrative Procedures, Proposed Amendment, Document No. 4897 (Attachment 5-1)

A Public Hearing was conducted concerning the Regulation. Ms. Elizabeth von Kolnitz, Chief, Office of Ocean and Coastal Resource Management, presented this item to the Board.

The Office of Ocean and Coastal Resource Management proposed the Notice of Final Regulation amending R.30-1, Statement of Policy, and R.30-14, Administrative Procedures. Legal authority resides in S.C. Code Sections 48-39-50 and 48-39-280, which require the Department to establish and review the position of the state’s beachfront jurisdictional baselines and setback lines every seven (7) to ten (10) years. The Administrative Procedures Act, S.C. Code Section 1-23-120(A), requires General Assembly review of these proposed amendments.

The Department proposed amending R.30-1. D. (43) and R.30-14. E., F., and G. to incorporate state statutory changes. Act 173 of 2018, the Beachfront Management Reform Act, establishes the position of the jurisdictional baselines and setback lines for the 2018 establishment cycle. The purpose of the jurisdictional lines is to delineate the extent of the Department’s direct permitting authority for activities within the defined beaches and beach/dune system critical areas. Section 8 of the Act required the Department to promulgate regulations in order to implement provisions of the Act, which includes regulations the Department will use to establish the jurisdictional lines and locate a primary oceanfront sand dune.

The Department convened a Beachfront Jurisdictional Line Stakeholder Workgroup (Workgroup) in 2018 to provide input into this process. The Workgroup was comprised of thirteen (13) members representing local governments and community associations, the real estate community, academic institutions, private-sector consultants, and non-profit organizations. The Workgroup was charged with providing recommendations to the Department for implementing future jurisdictional line review processes.

The Department had a Notice of Drafting published in the April 26, 2019, State Register. The Department received no public comments during the Notice of Drafting comment period.

The Department conducted three (3) informational forums to provide the public with the opportunity to discuss the process and outcomes of the Beachfront Jurisdictional Line...
Stakeholder Workgroup. Forums were held in Myrtle Beach, Charleston and Hardeeville/Bluffton on July 10, 11, and 18, 2019, respectively.

The Amendments proposed are based on final recommendations of the Workgroup and associated public engagement and input. The amendments provide clarity and standards to be utilized in the establishment of the state’s beachfront jurisdictional lines. The amendments also modify specific procedures related to appeals and movement of the jurisdictional lines to comply with Act 173 and Coastal Zone Critical Areas, Act 197 of 2016.

Department staff conducted an internal review of the proposed amendments on August 16, 2019.

The Department had a Notice of Proposed Regulation published in the September 27, 2019, State Register. The Department received public comments from one (1) organization by the October 28, 2019, close of the public comment period.

The Office of Ocean and Coastal Resource Management respectfully requested the Board grant a finding of need and reasonableness of the proposed amendments of R.30-1, Statement of Policy, and R.30-14, Administrative Procedures, for submission to the General Assembly.

Mr. Taylor opened the meeting up for public comments on this matter, but no one wished to speak, and the public hearing was closed. (Attachment 5-2)

After discussion, Mr. Joye moved, seconded by Ms. Shrivastava-Patel, that based on the public hearing and documents herein, to find the need and reasonableness of the Proposed Amendment to Regulation 30-1, Statement of Policy, and Regulation 30-14, Administrative Procedures, South Carolina Coastal Zone Management Act, Document No. 4897, and grant approval for the submission to the General Assembly for review. The Board voted and Motion carried.

A verbatim transcript of these proceedings is included as part of the official record. (Attachment 5-3)


A Public Hearing was conducted concerning the Regulation. Mr. Sandra Craig, Director, Division of Food and Lead Risk Assessments, presented this item to the Board.

The Bureau of Environmental Health Services ("Bureau") proposed the Notice of Final Regulation amending R.61-32, Soft Drink and Water Bottling Plants, revising and merging the requirements of R.61-54, Wholesale Commercial Ice Manufacturing, into R.61-32, and repealing the existing R.61-54. Legal authority resides in 1976 Code Sections 44-1-140 and 44-1-150, which enables the Department of Health and Environmental Control ("Department") to promulgate regulations for the operation of bottling plants and similar businesses. Furthermore, Section 44-1-150 allows for the enforcement of orders related to violations of these regulations. The Administrative Procedures Act, S.C. Code Section 1-23-120(A), requires General Assembly review of these proposed amendments and repeal.
The purpose of R.61-32, *Soft Drink and Water Bottling Plants*, and R.61-54, *Wholesale Commercial Ice Manufacturing*, is to safeguard public health and provide consumers safe, unadulterated soft drinks, bottled water, and wholesale ice products manufactured in South Carolina to be sold and distributed both in state and out of state. These regulations govern the production, processing, storing, labeling, transportation, and distribution of soft drinks, bottled water, and wholesale ice products. The current regulations are based on Title 21, *Food and Drugs*, Part 110, *Current Good Manufacturing Practice in Manufacturing, Packing, or Holding Human Food* of the Code of Federal Regulations (CFR) (21 CFR Part 110), which has now been replaced by 21 CFR Part 117, *Current Good Manufacturing Practice, Hazard Analysis, and Risk-Based Preventive Controls for Human Food*. The new federal regulation updates good manufacturing processes and incorporates new preventive controls for minimizing or preventing food safety hazards.

The Bureau proposed amending the provisions of R.61-32 and R.61-54 to incorporate standards of the new federal regulation. The structure of the federal regulation also facilitates combining provisions governing manufactured water-based products into one streamlined regulation, instead of two separate regulations with repetitive content. To achieve this more functional, streamlined regulation, the Department is repealing R.61-54 and combining its revised provisions into R.61-32. This also includes amending the title of R.61-32 to "*Wholesale Bottled Water, Soft Drinks, and Ice Manufacturing*." The amendments included in the Notice of Final Regulation also include other changes not required by federal law, such as additions, updates, and clarifications to administrative requirements, enforcement requirements, and definitions, as well as other changes deemed necessary by the Department to improve the overall clarity, organization, and quality of the regulation.

The amendments to these regulations serve to improve the overall clarity and effectiveness of applicable administrative, enforcement, and other requirements. In addition to clarification and updating of state-specific regulatory provisions, these amendments incorporate current federal standards, which have replaced preexisting federal standards upon which the Department’s existing, unrevised regulations are based. This serves to reduce administrative burdens on the regulated community by facilitating streamlined inspections and compliance under both state and federal requirements.

The Department had a Notice of Drafting published in the April 26, 2019, *State Register*.

The Bureau held a stakeholder meeting on July 24, 2019, in Columbia. The Bureau emailed information for meeting attendance to all permitted facilities, along with a proposed draft of the regulation to facilitate discussion. The Department also posted the information and draft regulation on the DHEC Manufactured Food web page to reach as broad an audience as possible.

Department staff conducted an internal review of the proposed amendments and repeal on July 29, 2019.

The Department had a Notice of Proposed Regulation published in the September 27, 2019, *State Register*. The Department received no public comments by the October 28, 2019, close of the public comment period.

The Bureau held an additional stakeholder meeting on October 9, 2019, in Columbia. The Bureau emailed information for meeting attendance to all permitted facilities, along with a copy of the proposed regulation to facilitate discussion. The Department also posted the
information and proposed regulation on the DHEC Manufactured Food web page to reach as broad an audience as possible.


Mr. Taylor opened the meeting up for public comments on this matter, but no one wished to speak. (Attachment 6-2) An email from Joan Hartley requesting a modification to the language of the regulation was provided to the Board and read into the record. No further comments were provided, and the public hearing was closed. (Attachment 6-3)

After discussion, **Mr. Singleton moved, seconded by Mr. Joyce, that based on the public hearing and documents submitted by Department staff, move to find for the need and reasonableness of the proposed amendment of Regulation 61-32, Soft Drink and Water Bottling Plants, and the proposed repeal of Regulation 61-54, Wholesale Commercial Ice Manufacturing, Document No. 4903, and grant approval for submission to the General Assembly for review with the following revision considered by public comment read into the Public Hearing record: In Section XV, change "The immediate EXCLUSION or RESTRICTION of the BOTTLED WATER, SOFT DRINKS, and ICE products concerned from distribution and use" to "The immediate removal of the BOTTLED WATER, SOFT DRINKS, and ICE products concerned from distribution and use. The Board voted and Motion carried.**

A verbatim transcript of these proceedings is included as part of the official record. (Attachment 6-4)


A Public Hearing was conducted concerning the Regulation. Mr. Sandra Craig, Director, Division of Food and Lead Risk Assessments, presented this item to the Board.

The Bureau of Environmental Health Services ("Bureau") proposed the Notice of Final Regulation amending R.61-36, *Frozen Desserts*, revising and merging the requirements of R.61-35, *Imitation Milk, Imitation Milk Products, and Products Made in Semblance of Milk and Milk Products*, into R.61-36, and repealing the existing R.61-35. Along with these amendments, the Department is adding regulatory requirements for manufacturing cheese, butter, and other non-grade "A" milk products to R.61-36, *Frozen Desserts*, and changing its title. Legal authority resides in S.C. Code Sections 44-1-140 and 44-1-150, which allow the Department of Health and Environmental Control ("Department") to promulgate regulations for the production, storing, labeling, transportation, and selling of milk and milk products, filled milk and filled milk products, imitation milk and imitation milk products, synthetic milk and synthetic milk products, milk derivatives, and any other products made in semblance of milk or milk products. Furthermore, 44-1-150 allows for the enforcement of orders related to violations of these regulations. The Administrative Procedures Act, S.C. Code Section 1-23-120(A), requires General Assembly review of these amendments and repeal.
The purpose of R.61-36, *Frozen Desserts*, and R.61-35, *Imitation Milk, Imitation Milk Products, and Products Made in Semblance of Milk and Milk Products*, is to safeguard public health and provide consumers safe, unadulterated frozen dessert and imitation dairy food products manufactured in South Carolina to be sold and distributed both in state and out of state. These regulations govern the production, processing, storing, labeling, transportation, and distribution of frozen desserts and imitation dairy foods that are not regulated as “Grade A” milk under the provisions of R.61-34, *Raw Milk for Human Consumption*, or R.61-34.1, *Pasteurized Milk and Milk Products*. The current regulations are based on Title 21, *Food and Drugs*, Part 110, *Current Good Manufacturing Practice in Manufacturing, Packing, or Holding Human Food* of the Code of Federal Regulations (21 CFR Part 110), which has now been replaced with 21 CFR Part 117, *Current Good Manufacturing Practice, Hazard Analysis, and Risk-Based Preventive Controls for Human Food*. The new federal regulation updates good manufacturing processes and incorporates new preventive controls for minimizing or preventing food safety hazards.

The Bureau proposed amending the provisions of R.61-36 and R.61-35 to incorporate standards of the new federal regulation. The structure of the federal regulation also facilitates combining provisions governing all manufactured dairy products into one streamlined regulation, instead of separate regulations with repetitive content. As part of this new streamlined regulation, the Bureau is adding requirements for manufacturing cheese, butter, and other non-grade “A” milk products. The South Carolina Department of Agriculture previously oversaw requirements for cheese and butter products (also under 21 CFR Part 110, *Current Good Manufacturing Practice in Manufacturing, Packing, or Holding Human Food*); however, per agreement between the two agencies, the Department has assumed oversight responsibility with respect to these products. To achieve this more functional, streamlined regulation, the Bureau is repealing R.61-35 and combining its revised provisions into R.61-36. This also includes amending the title of R.61-36 to “Manufactured Grade Dairy Products.” The amendments also include other changes not required by federal law, including updates from the current Pasteurized Milk Ordinance (“PMO”) and additions, updates, and clarifications to administrative requirements, enforcement requirements, and definitions, as well as other changes deemed necessary by the Department to improve the overall clarity, organization, and quality of the regulation.

The proposed amendments to these regulations serve to improve the overall clarity and effectiveness of applicable administrative, enforcement, and other requirements. In addition to clarification and updating of state-specific regulatory provisions, these amendments incorporate current federal standards, which have replaced preexisting federal standards upon which the Department’s existing, unrevised regulations are based. This serves to reduce administrative burdens on the regulated community by facilitating streamlined inspections and compliance under both state and federal requirements.

The Department had a Notice of Drafting published in the April 26, 2019, *State Register*.

The Bureau held stakeholder meetings on July 18, 2019, in Charleston and July 25, 2019, in Anderson. The Bureau emailed information for meeting attendance to all permitted facilities, along with a proposed draft of the regulation to facilitate discussion. The Department also posted the information and draft regulation on the DHEC manufactured food web page to reach as broad an audience as possible.

Department staff conducted an internal review of the proposed amendments and repeal on July 29, 2019.
The Department had a Notice of Proposed Regulation published in the September 27, 2019, State Register. The Department received no public comments by the October 28, 2019, close of the public comment period.

The Bureau held additional stakeholder meetings on October 3, 2019, in Charleston and October 10, 2019, in Anderson. The Bureau emailed information for meeting attendance to all permitted facilities, along with a copy of the proposed regulation to facilitate discussion. The Department also posted the information and proposed regulation on the DHEC manufactured food web page to reach as broad an audience as possible.

The Bureau respectfully request the Board to find need and reasonableness of the amendment of R.61-36, Frozen Desserts, and repeal of R.61-35, Imitation Milk, Imitation Milk Products, and Products Made in Semblance of Milk and Milk Products, for submission to the General Assembly.

Mr. Taylor opened the meeting up for public comments on this matter, but no one wished to speak. (Attachment 7-2) An email from Judy Papadimitriou requesting a modification to the language of the regulation was provided to the Board and read into the record. No further comments were provided, and the public hearing was closed. (Attachment 7-3)

After discussion, Mr. Kinney moved, seconded by Ms. Shrivastava-Patel, based on the public hearing and documents submitted by Department staff, move to find for the need and reasonableness of the proposed amendment of Regulation 61-36, Frozen Desserts, and the proposed repeal of Regulation 61-35, Imitation Milk, Imitation Milk Products and Products Made in Semblance of Milk and Milk Products, Document No. 4902, and grant approval for submission to the General Assembly for review with the following revision raised by public comment read into the public hearing record: In Section IX, change “The immediate EXCLUSION of that PERSON from handling MANUFACTURED GRADE DAIRY PRODUCTS, or their ingredients;” to “The immediate EXCLUSION or RESTRICTION of that PERSON from handling MANUFACTURED GRADE DAIRY PRODUCTS, or their ingredients;” and change “The immediate EXCLUSION of the MANUFACTURED GRADE DAIRY PRODUCTS of concern from distribution and use” to “The immediate removal of the MANUFACTURED GRADE DAIRY PRODUCTS of concern from distribution and use. The Board voted and Motion carried.

A verbatim transcript of these proceedings is included as part of the official record. (Attachment 7-4)

Item 8: Public Hearing and Request for Notice of Final Regulation Approval, Regulation 61-1, Medical and Dental Scholarship Fund, Proposed Repeal, Document No. 4898 (Attachment 8-1)

A Public Hearing was conducted concerning the Regulation. Mr. Bruce Busbee, Director, Office of Budgets and Financial Planning, Finance and Operations, presented this item to the Board.

The Office of Budgets and Financial Planning proposed the Notice of Final Regulation repealing R.61-1, Medical and Dental Scholarship Fund for publication in the September 27, 2019, South Carolina State Register (“State Register”). Legal authority resides in S.C. Code Sections 59-111-510 through 59-111-580, which established and outlined how the program was to be managed through the Department of Health and Environmental Control (“Department”). The
Administrative Procedures Act, S.C. Code Section 1-23-120(A), requires General Assembly review of this repeal.

S.C. Code Sections 59-111-510 through 59-111-580 established a Medical and Dental Scholarship Fund to be administered by the Department. Pursuant to S.C. Code Section 59-111-580, the Department promulgated R.61-1 to administer the program. In 1985, the General Assembly amended the statute to eliminate references to scholarships, leaving the program as only a loan fund, revised certain program criteria, and made other changes to the program. The regulation was never revised to conform to the amended statute.

The Department had a Notice of Drafting published in the March 22, 2019, State Register. Department staff conducted an internal review of the proposed repeal on August 7, 2019.

The Office of Budgets and Financial Planning emailed and phoned SC AHEC Executive Director Ann Lefebvre, MSW, CPHQ to inform the organization of the proposed drafting and rationale for the repeal.

The Department had a Notice of Proposed Regulation published in the September 27, 2019, State Register. The Department received no public comments by the October 28, 2019, close of the public comment period.

The Office of Budgets and Financial Planning respectfully requested the Board to find the need and reasonableness of the proposed repeal of Regulation 61-1, Medical and Dental Scholarship Fund, for submission to the General Assembly.

Mr. Taylor opened the meeting up for public comments on this matter, but no one wished to speak, and the public hearing was closed. (Attachment 8-2)

After discussion Ms. Shrivastava-Patel moved, seconded by Mr. Singleton, that based on the public hearing and documents herein, to find the need and reasonableness of the proposed Repeal of Regulation 61-1, Medical and Dental Scholarship Fund, Document No. 4898, and grant approval for the submission to the General Assembly for review. The Board voted and Motion carried.

A verbatim transcript of these proceedings is included as part of the official record. (Attachment 8-3)

**Item 9: Agency Affairs**

No items were presented to the Board.

**Item 10: Final Review Conference - Docket No. 19-RFR-48, Magnor Enterprises, LLC, Groundwater Withdrawal Permit, Berkeley County, Permit No. 08IN015, for groundwater withdrawal at source 08IN015G01**

At the call of the Final Review Conference, Counsel to the Board, Ashley Biggers, advised the Board that the parties had entered into a Consent Agreement withdrawing the Request for Final Review filed by the South Carolina Coastal Conservation League (CCL). (Attachment 10-2) Ms. Biggers informed the Board that the attorney for the Department, Nathan Haber,
would present the Consent Agreement and that the attorney for CCL would like the opportunity to address the Board. Mr. Haber provided a copy of the Agreement to the Board and detailed the agreement between the parties. Catherine Wannamaker, attorney for CCL, thanked the Board for their willingness to hear this matter and the Department staff and Maguro Enterprises, LLC (Google) for working with CCL for the benefit of the environment of South Carolina.

After discussion, the Board accepted this as information.

Being no further business, Mr. Lee adjourned the meeting.

All referenced attachments are made a permanent part of these minutes.

Respectfully submitted,

[Signature]

Charles M. Joyce, II, PE

Minutes approved this 6th day of January 2020.

ATTEST:

[Signature]

Mark R. Elam, Chairman

Attachments

0-1 Agenda
1-1 December 12, 2019 minutes
2-1 Administrative and Consent Orders issued by Health Regulation
3-1 Administrative Orders and Consent Orders issued by Environmental Affairs
4-1 Request for Notice of Final Regulation Approval, Regulation 61-43, Standards for the Permitting of Agricultural Animal Facilities
4-2 Public Hearing Sign in Sheet
4-3 Verbatim Transcript
5-1 Notice of Final Regulation Approval, Regulation 30-1, Statement of Policy, and Regulation 30-14, Administrative Procedures
5-2 Public Hearing Sign in Sheet
5-3 Verbatim Transcript
6-1 Notice of Final Regulation Approval, Regulation 61-32, Soft Drink and Water Bottling Plants, and Regulation 61-54, Wholesale Commercial Ice Manufacturing
6-2 Public Hearing Sign in Sheet
6-3 Public Comment Email
6-4 Verbatim Transcript
7-2 Public Hearing Sign in Sheet
7-3 Public Comment by Email
7-4 Verbatim Transcript
8-1 Notice of Final Regulation Approval, Regulation 61-1, Medical and Dental Scholarship Fund
8-2 Public Hearing Sign in Sheet
8-3 Verbatim Transcript
10-1 Final Review Conference - Docket No. 19-RFR-48, Maguro Enterprises, LLC
10-2 Consent Agreement